Experimental controls on D/H and 13C/12C ratios of kerogen, bitumen and oil during hydrous pyrolysis
Arndt Schimmelmann, Jean-Paul Boudou, Michael D. Lewan, Robert P. Wintsch

To cite this version:

HAL Id: bioemco-00156849
https://hal-bioemco.ccsd.cnrs.fr/bioemco-00156849
Submitted on 22 Jun 2007

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L’archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d’enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.
Experimental controls on D/H and $^{13}$C/$^{12}$C ratios of kerogen, bitumen and oil during hydrous pyrolysis

Arndt Schimmelmann$^{a,*}$, Jean-Paul Boudou$^{b}$, Michael D. Lewan, Robert P. Wintscha

$^{a}$Department of Geological Sciences, Indiana University, 1001 E. 10th Street, Bloomington, Indiana 47405-1405, USA
$^{b}$CNRS URA 1762, Physico-Chimie des Fluides Geologiques, Laboratoire de Geo chimie et Me’talloge´nie, Universite´ Pierre et Marie Curie; 4, Place Jussieu, Tour 16-26, 5e e’tage; F- 75230 Paris Cedex 05, France
$^{c}$US Geological Survey, Box 25046, MS 977, Denver Federal Center, Denver, CO 80225, USA

Abstract

Large isotopic transfers between water-derived hydrogen and organic hydrogen occurred during hydrous pyrolysis experiments of immature source rocks, in spite of only small changes in organic $^{13}$C/$^{12}$C. Experiments at 330°C over 72 h using chips or powder containing kerogen types I and III identify the rock/water ratio as a main factor affecting $\Delta D$ for water and organic hydrogen. Our data suggest that larger rock permeability and smaller rock grain size increase the H-isotopic transfer between water-derived hydrogen and thermally maturing organic matter. Increasing hydrostatic pressure may have a similar effect, but the evidence remains inconclusive.

Keywords: Hydrous pyrolysis; Hydrogen isotopes; Carbon isotopes; Deuterium; Kerogen; Bitumen; Oil; Lignite; Isotope exchange; Maturation

1. Introduction

Hydrous pyrolysis has become a successful laboratory method to simulate thermal maturation of source rocks in a pressure reactor (Lewan, 1993, 1997, 1998; Andresen et al., 1995; Michels et al., 1995). Under appropriate conditions, source rock chips that are submerged under water expel an oil phase that collects on the water surface and shows surprising similarity to natural petroleum (Lewan, 1997). $^3$D values of natural hydrocarbons have been used for exploration and paleoenvironmental reconstruction. However, we now recognize that hydrogen from water chemically participates in the thermal maturation of organic matter (Siskin and Katritzky, 1991; Price, 1994; Seewald et al., 1998), and becomes part of organic hydrogen (Hoering, 1984; Lewan, 1993, 1997; Seewald, 1994; Stalker et al., 1995, 1998; Junk and Catallo, 1997; Seewald et al., 1998; ACS, 1999; Schimmelmann et al., 1999; Leif and Simoneit, 2000). This challenges us to re-evaluate experimentally the utility of D/H ratios in thermally matured fossil fuels and formation waters for exploration and paleoenvironmental reconstructions. The presence of excess water in thermal maturation of sedimentary organic matter also fosters the phase separation between oil and bitumen, which is a prerequisite for oil migration, and thus affects the overall hydrogen and carbon isotope distribution among organic phases like kerogen, bitumen, and oil.

The influence of higher temperature and longer reaction time in hydrous pyrolysis experiments resulting in increased hydrogen isotopic transfer between water-derived hydrogen and organic hydrogen pools was documented by Schimmelmann et al. (1999) for four different source rocks. The present study explores
of water/rock ratio, grain size, and pressure at constant temperature and time. We avoid the word 'exchange' in describing the hydrogen isotope transfer between water-derived hydrogen and organic hydrogen, because the term 'exchange' fails to address the addition of hydrogen from inorganic sources to organic free radicals in quenching reactions, nor does it apply to the saturation of alkene groups. The broader term 'isotopic transfer' is better suited to account for the analytically determined net D-enrichment of organic hydrogen pools when in contact with hot, D-enriched water.

2. Methods

Compositions of two thermally immature source rocks utilized in this study are given in Table 1. All waters used in the hydrous pyrolysis experiments for this study had a starting $\Delta D$ value of +1260 per mil. The experimental conditions of the various thermal maturation experiments were a constant 330 °C for 72 h, but differed in pressure and loads (Table 2). Seven "GC"-labeled experiments were performed in cylindrical gold-cells (length 10 cm, i.d. 5 mm, headspace filled with argon) that were loaded with powdered rock (diameter 50 <m) and water, sealed by arc-welding, placed in the bore of a hydrothermal pressure vessel, and heated with a thermal accuracy of ±7 °C. Two "SS"-labeled experiments were run in stainless steel reactors (Schimmelmann et al., 1999) and used 2–7 mm diameter rock chips that were submerged under water, with nitrogen filling the headspace. The thermal accuracy of "SS"-experiments was ±1 °C. The weights of all loaded GC and SS reactor vessels before and after heating were unchanged to exclude the possibility of material loss due to leakage.

The "SS"-experiments yielded expelled oil that could be sampled from the surface of the water phase after hydrous pyrolysis. In the case of lignite, the expelled oil was waxy and solidified at room temperature. The recovered rock chips were dried and powdered in a ball mill. The extraction of rock powder with chloroform yielded bitumen. The "GC"-hydrous pyrolysis experiments in narrow gold cells at higher pressures required rock powder and smaller

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1</th>
<th>Characterization of immature source rock starting material</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kerogen type</td>
<td>Rock unit name, location, age; reference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Mahogany Shale, Green River Fm., Utah, Eocene; Ruble et al., 1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>Lignite from the Calvert Bluff Fm., Wilcox Group, Texas, Paleocene; Breyer, 1997</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$\Delta D_{nonlabile}$ = $\Delta D$ value of organic hydrogen in kerogen that does not exchange with water vapor at 115 °C (further details in Schimmelmann et al., 1999).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2</th>
<th>Experimental conditions of hydrous pyrolysis experiments in gold cells (GC-numbers) and stainless steel reactors (SS-numbers)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Experiment No.</td>
<td>Kerogen type</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-1</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-2</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-3</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-4</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-5</td>
<td>III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-6</td>
<td>III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-7</td>
<td>III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS-1</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS-2</td>
<td>III</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$\Delta D_{nonlabile}$ = $\Delta D$ value of organic hydrogen in kerogen that does not exchange with water vapor at 115 °C (further details in Schimmelmann et al., 1999).
amounts of water. "GC"-experiments, therefore, neither allowed sampling of an expelled oil phase nor the direct sampling of a residual water phase. Instead, after the piercing of gold cells, we inserted the cells individually in Pyrex side arms attached to small 6 mm o.d. Pyrex U-tubes that were cooled externally with liquid nitrogen and connected to a vacuum line. Water and a volatile hydrocarbon fraction from each gold cell were thus freeze-dried into a U-tube. The U-tubes were finally sealed at both ends with a micro-torch and the supernatant liquid, clear hydrocarbons. One side of each U-tube was opened and custom-made narrow-bore Pyrex capillaries were used to selectively subsample the water phase for D/H determination.

The dry rock powder was extracted with chloroform to yield bitumen which includes hydrocarbons that would have been expelled as oil in the presence of a large excess of water during hydrous pyrolysis. Extracted bitumen from "GC"- experiments is, therefore, the approximate equivalent of 'bitumen+oil' from "SS"- experiments.

Kerogens were prepared from chloroform-extracted rock powder using the HF/BF$_3$-method (Robl and Davis, 1993). Our earlier study (Schimmelmann et al., 1999) had used the conventional HCl/HF kerogen preparation method. To document the isotopic comparability of both methods, we prepared pairs of kerogens from rocks using both methods. Analytical procedures, including additional heavy-liquid demineralization of kerogens, isotopic equilibration of labile (e.g. exchangeable with water vapor at 115 °C) hydrogen in kerogens to arrive at $\delta^D$ values of nonlabile hydrogen in kerogen, combustion of organic substrates to yield CO$_2$ and water, reduction of water to H$_2$ gas, and the stable isotope mass-spectrometry followed

We report our hydrogen isotopic data according to Coplen’s (1996) guidelines relative to Vienna standard mean ocean water VSMOW (zero per mil) and normalized to standard light arctic precipitation SLAP (-428 per mil). Mass-spectrometric results in customary $\delta^D$ notation have a precision of ± 1.5 per mil for $\delta^D$ within the range of natural abundance, and ±0.05 per mil for $\delta^{13}C_{\text{CAR}}$ values. We caution that the accuracy deteriorated to an estimated ± 15 per mil for $\delta^D$ values above +1000 per mil, due to uncertainty in the extrapolation of the VSMOW–SLAP-based calibration without additional absolute standards with strong D-enrichment.

3. Results

Our analytical results derive from two thermally immature source rocks prior to artificial thermal maturation (Table 1) and from 9 hydrous pyrolysis experiments at 330 °C for 72 hours (Table 2).

3.1. Small variance of $^{13}C/^{12}C$ Ratios

Carbon stable isotope ratios of kerogen, bitumen and oil show relatively minor variance as a response to thermal maturation. The $^{13}C$ results in Table 3 underscore the well-known isotopic disproportionation of sedimentary organic carbon during thermal maturation into $^{13}C$-depleted low-molecular hydrocarbon compounds and relatively $^{13}C$-enriched remaining kerogen, as documented from anhydrous pyrolysis (Sackett, 1978; Peters et al., 1981; Arneth and Matzigkeit, 1986; reviewed by Whittaker, 1996), hydrous pyrolysis (Andersen et al., 1995; Elie et al., 1995).

Table 3

Analytical results from hydrous pyrolysis experiments in gold cells (GC) and stainless steel reactors (SS).a

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Experiment No.</th>
<th>Kerogen</th>
<th>Bitumen</th>
<th>Oil</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\delta^{13}C_{\text{CAR}}$</td>
<td>$\delta^{13}C_{\text{CAR}}$</td>
<td>$\delta^{13}C_{\text{CAR}}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-1</td>
<td>848</td>
<td>331</td>
<td>240c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-2</td>
<td>815</td>
<td>337</td>
<td>241c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-3</td>
<td>879</td>
<td>278</td>
<td>195c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-4</td>
<td>669</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>124c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-5</td>
<td>875</td>
<td>554</td>
<td>371c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-6</td>
<td>735</td>
<td>448</td>
<td>322c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-7</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>195c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS-1</td>
<td>1108</td>
<td>387,382</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS-2</td>
<td>998</td>
<td>607,611</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Water</th>
<th>$\delta^{13}C_{\text{CAR}}$</th>
<th>$\delta^{13}C_{\text{CAR}}$</th>
<th>$\delta^{13}C_{\text{CAR}}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GC-1</td>
<td>848</td>
<td>331</td>
<td>240c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-2</td>
<td>815</td>
<td>337</td>
<td>241c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-3</td>
<td>879</td>
<td>278</td>
<td>195c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-4</td>
<td>669</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>124c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-5</td>
<td>875</td>
<td>554</td>
<td>371c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-6</td>
<td>735</td>
<td>448</td>
<td>322c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC-7</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>195c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS-1</td>
<td>1108</td>
<td>387,382</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS-2</td>
<td>998</td>
<td>607,611</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Data in bold italic print indicate that the Robl and Davis (1993) BF$^+$ method was used for the preparation of kerogens.

$\delta^{13}C_{\text{CAR}}$$^a$$^b$$^c$$^d$ Value of organic hydrogen in kerogen that does not exchange with water vapor at 115 °C.

$\delta^{13}C_{\text{CAR}}$$^a$$^b$$^c$$^d$ Extracted bitumen contains the non-volatile oil fraction.

$\delta^{13}C_{\text{CAR}}$$^a$$^b$$^c$$^d$ Oil was not recovered as an expelled, separate phase following hydrous pyrolysis in gold cells.
3.2. Rock/water ratio

Hydrous pyrolysis reactors are closed systems where the magnitude of isotopic shifts depends in part on the relative sizes of the participating hydrogen pools. The rock/water ratio is thus an influential parameter because it determines the mass ratio of inorganic and organic hydrogen. During thermal maturation of source rocks, water with a starting $\delta^2D$ value of +1260 per mil is transferring deuterium to organic matter that has starting $\delta^2D$ values ranging from −224 to −130 per mil (Table 1). This hydrogen isotopic transfer increases $\delta^2D_{\text{organic}}$ values from originally negative to positive values and at the same time decreases $\delta^2D_{\text{water}}$ values (Table 3). Experiments GC-1 and GC-2 with similar rock/water ratios and otherwise identical experimental parameters indicate good reproducibility of $\delta^2D$ values (Fig. 1). The paired experiments GC-3 and GC-4 for Green River Fm. shale, and experiments GC-6 and GC-7 for lignite were all performed at a pressure of 400 MPa and differ only in their rock/water ratios (Table 2). Each pair shows organic hydrogen isotopic differences that are directly attributable to, and consistent with increasing rock/water ratios (Fig. 1). Shifts in $\delta^2D_{\text{water}}$ values during hydrous pyrolysis experiments at low rock/water ratios up to 1.52 in Fig. 1 are much larger for the organic-hydrogen-rich lignite (dotted line with steeper slope) with abundant D-depleted organic hydrogen than for the relatively mineral-rich Green River Fm. shale (solid line with smaller slope) containing less abundant organic hydrogen. Shifts in $\delta^2D$ from experiments GC-5, SS-1, and SS-2, however, not only reflect changes in rock/water ratio (Fig. 1), but are additionally affected by differences in pressure and grain size (Table 2). A linear relationship between $\delta^2D$ values of kerogens and bitumens is apparent in Fig. 3, regardless of experimental differences. The rock/water ratio is the key factor determining $\delta^2D$ values of the two organic phases that are immobile during hydrous pyrolysis experiments. $\delta^2D$ Values of immature, unreacted source rocks fall on or near the regression line, in spite of the fact that they were not used in the linear regression. Data for untreated kerogen and bitumen reflect, essentially, infinite rock/water ratios. The $\delta^2D_{\text{water}}$ value for experiment GC-3 is abnormally high in comparison with other gold cell data and likely reflects an analytical error, but still agrees qualitatively with our observation of a strong rock/water influence (Fig. 1). Experiment GC-3, however, will not be considered further when investigating other, more subtle experimental influences on D/H shifts.

In contrast to D/H ratios, carbon isotope ratios for each source rock type show only small and

![Fig. 1. Hydrogen isotope data from hydrous pyrolysis experiments at 330 °C for 72 h, utilizing thermally immature source rocks that contain kerogen types-I and-III. All waters had an initial $\delta^2D$ value of +1260 per mil. With decreasing rock/water ratio the organic hydrogen pools tend to receive more deuterium from water via isotopic transfer. SS-1 and SS-2 sampled supernatant oil separate from extracted bitumen, whereas experiments in gold cells yielded only one combined ‘bitumen’ phase upon extraction. We caution that in many experiments the rock/water ratio is not the only variable influencing D/H ratios (see Table 2).]

3.3. Grain size, permeability, and pressure

Experiments SS-1 and SS-2 utilized rock chips, whereas all gold cell experiments used rock powder. SS-1 using dense, mineral rich Green River Fm. shale with a rock/water ratio of 1.0 is the only experiment that does not fit the pattern from water-rich to rock-rich experiments in Fig. 2, but plots where one expects a rock/water ratio of 3. SS-2 using permeable lignite chips fits the pattern in Fig. 2 regardless of grain size. A general pattern of decreasing hydrogen isotopic differences $\delta^2D_{\text{water-organic}}$ with increasing pressure is suggested in Fig. 3. We caution, however, that the experiments also varied slightly in their rock/water ratios and used different grain sizes of source rocks (Table 2). In the case

\[\delta^2D_{\text{water-organic}}\]
Fig. 2. δD Values of kerogens and bitumens of the 9 hydrous pyrolysis experiments define a linear regression line, with R²=0.97. δD Values from immature, unreacted source rocks fall on or near the regression line, in spite of the fact that they were not used in the linear regression. Numbers in brackets indicate experimental rock/water ratios; untreated kerogen and bitumen reflect essentially infinite rock/water ratios.

Fig. 3. The isotopic differences δD between δD values of the final waters and the δD values of organic hydrogen pools after hydrous pyrolyses of Green River Fm. shale and lignite containing types-I and-III kerogens, respectively. All waters had an initial δD value of +1260 per mil. The pressure is plotted on a logarithmic scale. Experiments at 13 MPa in stainless steel reactors utilized rock chips, whereas experiments at higher pressures in gold cells used powdered rock. Lines are drawn to guide the eye. We caution that in many experiments pressure is not the only variable influencing δD (see Table 2).

of lignite, the ASDwater-organic values in Fig. 3 plot in an almost linear fashion over the logarithmic pressure regardless of grain size, suggesting that high porosity and presence of fissures in lignite limits the significance of grain size. In contrast, Green River Fm. shale rock chips (at 13 MPa) plot with much larger ASDwater-organic values when compared against Green River Fm. shale powder (at 50 MPa). Larger grain size of the denser and less permeable shale may be responsible for retardation of isotopic transfer due to slower transportation or diffusion of water through rock chips.

3.4. Isotopic influence from the method of kerogen preparation

The two methods of wet-chemical kerogen preparation (HCl/HF or BF₃) do not result in significant carbon isotopic differences between pairs of kerogens. The hydrogen isotopic differences are 4–5 per mil and non-systematic. Five other pairs of kerogens from shales, which are not part of this study, showed even smaller hydrogen isotopic differences of up to 3 per mil. The BF₃-method (Robl and Davis, 1993) operates at room temperature and has the advantage of minimizing chemical degradation of kerogen, in contrast to conventional demineralization in hot, concentrated acids. Additional advantages are apparent in the speed and safety of the BF₃ method, and in a lower ash content of kerogens when compared with the HCl/HF method.

4. Discussion

4.1. Comparability of results from experiments in steel and gold reactors

The spatial limitation of experiments in small gold cells prevented us from conducting specific pairs of experiments in gold cell and carburized stainless steel reactors, to test for surface-catalytic artifacts while keeping all other experimental variables constant. The isotopic variance observed in our experiments can be attributed to distinct experimental conditions and gives no evidence for catalytic influence of either gold or carburized stainless steel surfaces in the process of artificial thermal maturation. This interpretation is supported by kinetic results from hydrous pyrolysis experiments that indicate the direct comparability of data from gold-cell reactors and from carburized stainless steel reactors (Knauss et al., 1997).

4.2. Hydrogen isotopic transfer in artificial maturation

Isotopic transfer between water-derived hydrogen and organic hydrogen under conditions of artificial thermal maturation of organic matter was observed in several studies using D₂O (Hoering, 1984; Stalker et al., 1995, 1998; Lewan, 1997; Leif and Simoneit, 2000) and deuterium-enriched waters (Schimmelmann et al., 1999). The activated transition states during reaction of organic matter, via radical and/or ionic mechanisms, offer a window of opportunity for water-derived hydrogen to covalently bond with organic carbon. Even in the
absence of reactions involving carbon-carbon bond breaking, some carbon-bound hydrogen is isotopically exchangeable with water-derived hydrogen. For example, some hydrogen in condensed and substituted aromatic systems is exchangeable at elevated temperature, and most N-, O-, and S-bound organic hydrogen is exchangeable with water-hydrogen even at room temperature in contact with water vapor (see Schimmelmann et al., 1999). In contrast, exchange experiments of aliphatic and low-molecular aromatic compounds in D2O in absence of organic-chemical reactions suggested that most hydrogen in hydrocarbons exchanges very slowly at 200–240 °C and that measurable 8D shifts are not to be expected in less than 10 years for uncatalyzed exchange under natural conditions (Koepp, 1978; Yeh and Epstein, 1981; Schoell 1984).

The hydrogen isotopic changes during artificial maturation experiments depend on the mass ratios of the available hydrogen pools, which are controlled by the initial ratio of rock to water (Fig. 1). For example, the isotopic shift for every four deuterium atoms added to kerogen, only ASDorganic values are smallest in gold cell reactors where rock was in contact with relatively little water. In the latter case, the ASDwater is large because some 1H from D-depleted organic functional groups (–OH, –COOH, –NH2, etc.) is transferred from organic matter and from hydrogen-containing minerals in source rock to water. The isotopic consequences of a chosen rock/water ratio are merely reflecting the overall isotopic mass balance in a closed system and are not constraining chemical reactions during thermal maturation. Lewan (1997) has shown that the rock/water ratio has no effect on the extent of chemical reaction during hydrolysis, as measured by expelled oil generation.

Equal rates of deuterium transfer from water to either kerogen or bitumen during hydrolysis would result in a slope of one for the regression line in Fig. 2. Instead, the slope of 0.77 (n = 9; R2 = 0.97) suggests that for every four deuterium atoms added to kerogen, only approximately three D atoms enter bitumen during hydrolysis pyrolysis. It is intriguing that kerogens and bitumens from untreated source rocks falls near the initial ratio of rock to water (Fig. 1). For example, the natural permeability of chips of lignite via fis-

Increased pressure may force more D-enriched H2O into the bitumen-soaked pore space of the less compressible rock matrix, thus increasing the ratio of water-hydrogen versus organic hydrogen within the source rock, and resulting in a net increase in deuterium transfer to organic hydrogen. A major effect of hydrostatic pressure enhancing the rate of diffusion through micropore systems was noted by Noor et al. (1986). Higher pressure also increases the solubility of water in bitumen, similar to the situation between water and silicate and basaltic melts where the partial molar volume of dissolved H2O is smaller than the molar volume of free H2O (Yoder, 1979; Pineau et al., 1998). Hydrostatic pressure has long been recognized as a factor in the thermal maturation of organic material (Landais et al., 1994; Michels et al., 1994, 1995), although possibly of limited influence (Knauss et al., 1997). Higher pressure in hydrolysis of Woodford Shale (containing type-II kerogen; Landais et al., 1994; Michels et al., 1994, 1995) was reported to reduce and retard the chemical maturation of kerogen and polar compounds, which seems to contradict our interpretation of isotopic results from type-I and-III source rocks. However, the Woodford Shale studies do not give assurance that intergranular and headspace within sealed gold cells under hydrolysis conditions were sufficiently small relative to the available volume of liquid water to ensure that rock, organic matter and water experienced hydrostatic fluid pressure rather than grain-supported lithostatic pressure. Lithostatic pressure would not be conveyed to organic matter and fluid phases and would thus improperly test for the influence of fluid pressure on the kinetics of organic reactions in the presence of water. Our gold cell experiments used sufficient water to arrive at the described hydrostatic pressures of up to 400 MPa. We caution that our data presented in Fig. 3 are no proof for fluid pressure as an important control on hydrogen isotopic exchange, because our experiments do not maintain a constant rock/water ratio and thus cannot dismiss the claim that part or all of the observed ASD variance is caused by factors other than pressure. Further investigations are required.

The SS-2 results from rock chips of highly permeable lignite (containing type-II kerogen) compare well with results from gold cell experiments (GC-5, GC-6, GC-7) that used powdered lignite (Figs. 2 and 3). We suggest that the natural permeability of chips of lignite via fissures is so large that powdering to particle sizes below 50 μm does not greatly enhance isotopic transfer kinetics in our experiments. In contrast, chips (SS-1) and powder (GC-1, GC-2, GC-4) of the less permeable Green River Fm. shale show a large difference. SS-1 is also the only experiment that does not plot in Fig. 2 according to its experimental rock/water ratio of one, but indicates an effective rock/water ratio of about 3. There seems to be significantly less isotopic transfer...
between inorganic and organic hydrogen phases in experiment SS-1 when the less permeable Green River Fm. shale (containing type-I kerogen) is used in 2–7 mm chips, in comparison with experiments GC-1, GC-2, and GC-4 that used powdered shale. The hypothesized effect of grain size for less permeable rock cannot be quantitatively separated from that of increasing pressure, but we feel that the observed strong isotopic differences across the small range of 13 MPa for SS to 50 MPa for GC experiments (Fig. 3) are unlikely caused by pressure when raising the pressure further to 400 MPa does not result in large isotopic changes. The A-D offset between lignite and shale-derived data in Fig. 3 is in part due to the more aliphatic, less reactive character of type-I kerogen in the Green River Fm. relative to more aromatic type-III kerogen from lignite.

4.3. Relevance of hydrogen isotopic results from hydrous pyrolysis for natural maturation

Extrapolation of our results from hydrous pyrolysis experiments to naturally maturing organic matter allows us to predict that the D/H ratios in organic fractions will become increasingly shifted in the direction of the isotopic composition of ambient formation waters. Marine source rocks would originally contain marine-derived formation waters with δD values close to zero per mil, whereas terrigenous source rocks would likely be in contact with somewhat D-depleted formation waters, depending on local meteoric and hydrologic conditions. In most cases the water would be significantly D-enriched relative to typically D-depleted organic hydrogen in sediments (Schoell, 1984).

Fig. 4. Comparative overview of hydrogen and carbon isotope ratios in organic fractions from natural maturational sequences. Top row: δD values of kerogen, saturated hydrocarbons (SHC), aromatic hydrocarbons (AHC), and nitrogen- sulfur-, and oxygen-containing extractable compounds (NSO) show a strong general trend towards less negative δD values with increasing thermal maturity, or depth. Data on bulk coal are an exception, possibly because untreated bulk coal contains a significant amount of mineral hydrogen which influences bulk δD values. Bottom row: trends of δ13C values over increasing thermal maturity strongly vary among the cited studies.
transfer between water-derived hydrogen and organic hydrogen will therefore shift organic hydrogen towards less negative $\delta^D$ values. Oil contains the highest concentration of aliphatic, isotopically non-exchangeable hydrogen (Koepp, 1978; Schoell, 1984). Indeed, Yeh and Epstein (1981) found a tentative correlation between $\delta^D$ values of 114 petroleum samples with latitude, but not with maturity. $\delta^D$ values of total hydrocarbons in light oils from marine source rocks tend to be less negative than those of non-marine origin (Shen, 1995). Likewise, the $\delta^D$ values of oils from Northeastern Brazil were found to be mainly related to $\delta^{18}O$ values in the paleoenvironments in which the primary producers lived, but were not related to thermal maturation, biodegradation, or distance of the secondary migration (Santos Neto and Hayes, 1999). With increasing thermal maturity the hydrogen isotopic fate of immobile kerogen and bitumen is likely more complicated than that of oil, namely that the concentration of water-derived hydrogen in immobile phases may increase and will cause relative isotopic differences between phases or compound classes to decrease.

Our predictions are supported by several published coal and petroleum $\delta^D$ datasets across thermal maturation gradients (Fig. 4). Schoell’s (1984) $\delta^D$ values from Mahakam Delta type-III kerogen, associated saturated hydrocarbon extract (SHEC), aromatic hydrocarbon extract (AHC) and nitrogen-, sulfur-, and oxygen-containing extractable heterocomponents (NSO) all exhibit overall trends towards less negative $\delta^D$ values with increasing thermal maturity. Kerogen, AHC, and NSO also become isotopically more similar to each other, whereas the chemically less reactive (isotopically more conservative) SHEC largely parallels the isotopic trends of kerogen. $\delta^D$ values of kerogen and extracts from the Norwegian North Sea also exhibit overall trends towards less negative $\delta^D$ and smaller $\Delta D_{\text{kerogen-bitumen}}$ values with increasing thermal maturity (Schou et al., 1985). Likewise, extracts from Australian coals become more $D$-enriched over depth (Rigby et al., 1981). The extracts from coals isotopically agree well with associated oils, but $\delta^D$ values of the bulk coal are likely compromised by contamination from mineral hydrogen. Interestingly, the offshore coals and their extracts were found to be more $D$-enriched than their onshore counterparts, and the authors speculated that this was the result of hydrogen isotopic exchange between water and organic hydrogen in coal.

We agree with Schoell (1984) that climatic and biotic changes affecting the isotopic character of the original biomass may have contributed to $D/H$ variability in geological settings over depth and time, but such influences are typically oscillatory in nature and rarely manifest themselves in long-term trends as depicted in Fig. 4. The loss of thermogenic $^{13}C$ and $D$-depleted methane and other low-molecular hydrocarbons undoubtedly contributed to some observed isotopic trends in the residual organic matter, in particular in case of the Mahakam Delta data (Schoell, 1984), but the absence of a parallel $^{13}C$-enrichment over depth in the other records in Fig. 4 suggests that thermogenic loss of hydrocarbons cannot adequately explain the observed $D/H$ trends. Instead, the long-term trends towards $D$-enrichment coinciding with increasing thermal maturity are likely caused by isotopic transfer of relatively $D$-enriched, water-derived hydrogen during thermal-maturation reactions, as simulated in our hydrous pyrolysis experiments.

5. Conclusions

1. After temperature and time (Schimmelmann et al., 1999), the rock/water ratio is the third most important experimental control on the hydrogen isotopic transfer in hydrous pyrolysis.

2. Less deuterium uptake by organic matter in Green River Fm. shale than by organic matter in lignite may be attributed to the significantly smaller permeability of the denser shale when compared against the lignite with high microporosity and presence of fissures. An underlying mechanism may be the larger diffusive barrier for water in the bitumen-impregnated shale, especially when the shale is used in the form of chips rather than as a fine powder. An additional factor is likely the more aliphatic, less reactive character of type-I kerogen in the Green River Fm. relative to more aromatic type-III kerogen.

3. Inconclusive evidence suggests that higher hydrostatic pressure may cause increased hydrogen isotopic transfer. Additional experiments are needed.

4. In contrast to hydrogen, the organic carbon disproportionates isotopically during hydrous pyrolysis to kerogen, bitumen, and oil, expressing isotopic shifts of up to ca. 1 per mil, with no obvious dependence on pressure, grain size, or rock/water ratio. Thermogenic gas was not considered in this study.

5. Extrapolation of hydrous pyrolysis-derived isotopic results to natural thermal maturation predicts that $D/H$ ratios in coal, kerogen, extracted bitumen, and to a lesser degree in oil, will be increasingly altered with rising thermal maturity by transfer of deuterium from ambient formation waters. Published $D/H$ stratigraphic profiles conform the expected $\Delta D$ across maturational gradients for kerogen, oil fractions, and extracts. In the same stratigraphic profiles, carbon isotope ratios of the organic fractions follow different patterns that cannot be correlated uniformly with $\Delta D$ or increasing thermal maturity.

Acknowledgements

We thank two anonymous reviewers for insightful comments. Acknowledgement is made to NATO
Collaborative Research Programme grant 971381, to the donors of The Petroleum Research Fund, administered by the American Chemical Society, for support of this research with grant No. 31203–AC2, to the US Geological Survey under Energy Resources Project 51564, and to the Department of Energy, Basic Energy Research Grant No. DE-FG02-00ER15032.

Associate Editors—M. Kruege and J. Curiale

References


